

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Special meeting of the Ishpeming City Council was held on Wednesday, July 9, 2025, in the Ishpeming City Hall Council Chambers. Mayor Pat Scanlon called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Mayor Pat Scanlon, Council Members Ben Argall, Brett Argall, Jason Chapman, and Kurt Kipling (5). Also present was City Manager Randy Scholz and City Attorney Caroline Bridges.

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

A motion was made by Mayor Pat Scanlon, seconded by Councilmember Kurt Kipling, and carried unanimously to move the public comment to before adjournment.

A motion was made by Councilmember Jason Chapman, seconded by Councilmember Kurt Kipling, and carried unanimously to approve the agenda as amended.

4. PUBLIC COMMENT – Moved to before adjournment.

5. ITEMS OF BUSINESS

a. Listening/Information Session regarding Fluoride in the drinking water

i. Requests to keep fluoride in the drinking water (20 minutes)

Patrick Jacuzzo, Director of Environmental Health, presented the position of the Marquette County Health Department (MCHD). Their official statement was in support of fluoride. He added in consideration of all the evidence, it was the position of the MCHD that the removal, or discontinuation, of fluoride in the drinking water would have negative effects on the dental health and overall health and wellness of the population. The MCHD continues to recommend community drinking water fluoridation at the recommended concentration of 0.7 mg/L and would continue to monitor the scientific literature regarding the issue.

Robert Lorinser, Marquette County Health Department Medical Director, supported fluoride in the drinking water at the appropriate levels. He added dental health was a priority and the removal of fluoride from the drinking water would make the situation worse. There was a need for preventative measures to ensure the best dental health for everyone.

Robin Bond, 2011 Deer Lake Avenue in Ishpeming, a professor at Northern Michigan University, talked about the science of fluoridation in drinking water, the benefits and the myths, and fluoride taken in other forms.

Dr. Brian Anderson, 229 Shoreline Drive Negaunee, talked about why fluoride should remain in the drinking water at the recommended level of 0.7 mg/L which has been proven to work and is safe. He added in communities where there is too much fluoride, teeth are black; and he can tell when he treats a patient that does not have fluoride in their drinking water. If fluoride is removed from the drinking water, dental health will get worse. It would not be immediate, however, but long term there would be an increase in poor dental health. He implored the City not to remove fluoride from the drinking water.

Rebecca Maino, 725 Carr Street, and Registered Dental Hygienist and Health Educator for the MCHD, has coordinated many schools and community based dental programs over the years. She added removing fluoride from the water would decrease dental health in our community. She had done kindergarten screening and children living in areas without fluoride in the water have worse teeth. Everyone has a choice to drink water with fluoride or purchase water without fluoride. She urged the Council to contact the Water Authority and to listen to the science; and to please keep fluoride in the drinking water and thanked Council for their time.

ii. Requests to eliminate fluoride in the drinking water (20 minutes)

Valorie Olson, from Marquette, provided some information from the NTP report which stated at 0.7 mg/L of fluoride children are put at neurological harm; she talked about the harmful effects to children and unborn children at that level.

She added fluoride was not safe and should not be put in the public's drinking water at any level; the public water should be made safe for all to drink. She urged the Council to review all the materials and remove the fluoride from the drinking water.

Carrie Plummer, Negaunee City resident, thanked the Mayor and the Councilmembers for holding the listening session. She reviewed some of the findings and noted that fluoride was a neurotoxin. She added the promoters of fluoride are ignoring the mounting data indicating the harmful effects of fluoride. She reviewed several studies and data notating the negative effects of fluoride in the water. She added the ones at most risk are babies and children, and it would be unethical to dismiss the findings. She urged the Ishpeming City Council to consider the removal of fluoride from the drinking water.

Jeff Plummer, Negaunee City resident, talked about the mounting scientific evidence to the harmful effects of fluoride and questioned why it is still in our drinking water. He suggested correlation does not equal causation and added the government should not have the right to put fluoride in the drinking water, it should be everyone's choice to not be medicated. He urged the Council to do their own research and to give residents the purest water possible.

### iii. Clarifying questions from Councilmembers

Councilmember Jason Chapman questioned the study done by Judge Chen. Each party (retain fluoride and eliminate fluoride) provided some background information on the study.

Councilmember Jason Chapman questioned if the dental professionals saw a direct correlation between people with fluoride in the drinking water and those that do not; Rebecca Maino, MCHD, advised in her experiences she can tell the difference between her patients that have fluoride in their drinking water than those that do not.

## 4. PUBLIC COMMENT

Jim Rahoi, former Finance Officer at the MCHD, pointed out every dollar spent on fluoride in drinking water reduced dental costs.

Claudia Demarest, 821 Maurice, and resident of the City of Ishpeming, would prefer to keep fluoride in the drinking water to help to reduce cavities in young children; if residents do not want to drink the water with fluoride there is the option of bottled water.

Ron Elberth, 106 High Excelsior Street in Ishpeming, did not support fluoride in the drinking water. He expressed his concerns about the amount of fluoride children are getting.

Hillary Brandenburg, Juniper Street in Ishpeming, is an RN at the MCHD and has worked with low-income people for over 10 years, and noted low-income individuals do not have the same access to dental care. She supported fluoride in the drinking water.

Dave Levertson, 100 E. Barnum Street, thought the best science supports fluoride in drinking water and he would like the City to continue providing fluoride in the water supply.

Dr. Pete Belpedio, retired dentist and lived in Ishpeming for 21 years, supported fluoride in the drinking water. He added there was a noticeable difference between patients that had fluoride in their drinking water and those that did not. Tooth pain was very painful, particularly for children, and he urged the council to keep fluoride in the drinking water.

Marisa Maino, lived in Ishpeming for many years and now lives in Negaunee, stated she had fluoride in her drinking water her entire life, she has a high IQ and has not had any cavities. She asked Council to please listen to the professionals and keep fluoride in the drinking water.

***Ishpeming City Council Special Proceedings: July 9, 2025***  
***Ishpeming, MI 49849***

Jane Hendrick, Ishpeming resident, explained her daughter is very sensitive to fluoride; she is paying for Ishpeming water but does not drink it because of her daughter's sensitivity. She thought this was a great opportunity for her daughter's voice to be heard.

Dr. Jim Hayword, Buffalo Road in Negaunee, supported fluoride in the drinking water. He stated if the fluoride is removed from the water, it would cause a decrease in dental health. He encouraged Council to leave fluoride in the water for the community.

Paul Altobello, 1965 Southwood Dr, worked at the Wastewater Treatment Plant, for over 30 years, supported fluoride in the drinking water.

Emily Stack, 321 W. Barnum Street in Ishpeming, has had fluoride in her drinking water her entire life, has zero cavities, and urged Council to keep fluoride in the City's drinking water.

Rachel Matta, 636 Jopling Street in Ishpeming and social worker at the MCHD, stated there was a definite need for all medical care for pediatrics in our area and encouraged the Council to keep fluoride in the drinking water to help the children as much as possible.

Kathy Mell, Negaunee, a nurse since 1985, found it heartbreaking to have fluoridation and vaccinations being attacked; she urged the Council to keep fluoride in the drinking water to protect the dental health of everyone.

Bill Ballard, dentist, 2625 W. Fair Avenue Marquette, talked about the benefits of fluoride and how it helps to protect teeth. Fluoride was the best tool to prevent cavities and should remain in the water.

Jason Chapman 204 Ready, Ishpeming, has many issues with his teeth and added poor dental health effects total health. He supported fluoride in the drinking water.

George Sedlacek, Negaunee resident, did not want to see fluoride taken out of the drinking water and urged both the Negaunee and Ishpeming City Councils to keep fluoride in the drinking water.

Jennifer Iller, Gwinn resident and Health Educator at the MCHD, stated fluoride in the drinking water is one of the most effective measures for dental health and it has been provided for many years. She encouraged the Council to keep fluoride in the drinking water.

Gino Maino, lived in Ishpeming for 25 years but currently resides in Negaunee, has had fluoride in his drinking water his entire life and encouraged Council to listen to the many professionals that have stated how important it is to have fluoride in the water. He asked Council to continue the fluoride in the community's water.

Dr. Katelyn Wetton, dentist at 906 Dentistry in Ishpeming, was present to advocate for her patients and her family to continue fluoridation in the water at the current levels. She took an oath to do no harm, and she would not advocate for her patients if she did not believe in fluoridation for herself and her family.

Angela Kiviniemi, 3765 Co. Rd. CL in Ishpeming, and served on the Ishpeming School Board, supported fluoride in the drinking water for those children that do not see dentists on a regular basis as this provides a level of prevention. She encouraged the Council to keep fluoride in the drinking water.

Linda Marshall, Negaunee Township resident, works with pregnant and breast-feeding families and the levels of fluoride in the drinking water is safe. At these levels it does not affect the fetus or the breastfeeding moms. She encouraged the Council to keep fluoride in the drinking water.

***Ishpeming City Council Special Proceedings: July 9, 2025***  
***Ishpeming, MI 49849***

Henry Plummer, Negaunee resident, explained his baby teeth were affected by fluorosis and urged the Council to consider the removal of fluoride from the drinking water.

Beverly Matherne, 602 N. Third Street, would like the fluoride to be removed from the drinking water.

Sue (*last name inaudible*), medical massage practitioner at 116 E. Division Street, expressed her concern with adding fluoride to the drinking water because it removes the right to choose. She urged the Council to remove the fluoride from the drinking water to allow individuals to choose if they want fluoride or not.

Jen (*last name inaudible*), would like to have fluoride removed from the drinking water and asked Council to provide clean water to all residents.

Dave Campana, 1711 Grandview Drive in Marquette, retired pharmacist, urged Council to keep fluoride in the drinking water at the 0.7 mg/L which has never been found to be harmful.

Amy Moss, resident of Marquette, would like to see fluoride removed from the drinking water and gave some data related to other countries.

Amanda Ghanavati, Negaunee City Council member and Ishpeming business owner, was oppose to fluoride in the drinking water; she reviewed the effects it could have on children and elderly adults; and asked Council to review the materials. She urged the Council to remove fluoride from the drinking water.

Sofia (*no last name given*) opposed the use of fluoride in the drinking water and asked for it to be removed from the water. She would like to have the choice for herself and her family.

Kelly Ghanavati, County Road in Negaunee, opposed water fluoridation.

Michelle Dobbs, from Marquette, opposed fluoride in the water and asked Council to keep the water clean.

Abby Laforest, reporter and resident of Marquette City, noticed everyone in the room cared about the community and suggested everyone work together and determine the best way forward.

Issac Bimel, 216 W. Peck, stated his mom used to buy bottled water and then they switched to tap water in the last year and he now has cavities.

Belle Bimel, 216 W. Peck, Negaunee resident, opposed fluoride in the municipal water supply and asked Council to respect choice and remove fluoride from the drinking water.

Pat Zhulkie, Ishpeming resident and dental hygienist, has seen the effects of fluoride and it does prevent cavities and should stay in the drinking water.

Jon Becker, Negaunee resident and Negaunee Council member, stated Negaunee just had the same issue at a meeting and asked Councilmembers to do their due diligence. Everything he read at the levels of fluoride used in the community; it is safe. He summarized the numbers speaking in favor versus those opposed.

Dave Kangas, Negaunee resident, heard both sides of the argument and there was passion on both sides. Asked Council to listen to the science.

Rick North, resident of Negaunee, stated if no one is sure that fluoride is causing harm than it should be left out of the drinking water.

***Ishpeming City Council Special Proceedings: July 9, 2025***  
***Ishpeming, MI 49849***

Karen Day, 100 County Road PCE, taught physiology for 35 years. Fluoride helps prevent cavities and strengthens teeth, however, would like fluoride removed from the water because fluoride supplements could be used.

**6. ADJOURNMENT**

At 8:35 p.m., a motion was made by Councilmember Kurt Kipling seconded by Councilmember Ben Argall and carried unanimously to adjourn.

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Cathy Smith", is written over a horizontal line.

Cathy Smith, City Clerk